Drink. Water Eng. Sci. Discuss.,
https://doi.org/10.5194/dwes-2018-37-RC2, 2019

Drinking Water
Engineering and Science
Discussions

Interactive comment on "Evaluation of human risks of surface and groundwater contaminated with Cd and Pb south of El-Minya Governorate, Egypt" *by* Salman Salman et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 21 January 2019

In this paper Cd and Pb are monitored in groundwater and surface water and compared to WHO guidelines. The paper is poorly written and not very innovative, since most of the sampling was already done before. General comments: - Give clear objective (and knowledge gap) at the end of the introduction. - "Location" should be part of the Materials and Methods section (not of introduction) - Explain why Health Risk Assessment gives other information than WHO guidelines - Check language, including tenses. - Introduce abbreviations (like Cd and Pb) once and then use the abbreviations in the rest of the manuscript. - Structure the description of Cd and Pb in the introduction in the same way. - Use same structure for describing Cd and Pb (as on pg 2) - Avoid repetitions in the paper (like first 4 sentences on pg 3). Specific comments: - Pg 1, line

17, delete "in addition,. . . human activities" from abstract. - Pg1, line 21, 2x "pollutions" - Pg 1, line 22, amount = concentrations - Pg 1, line 24, content = concentrations - Pg 2, line 19, delete second "body" - Pg 5, line 16-17, delete sentence "the close. . .. their source". - Pg 5, line 19-20, not relevant - Pg 5, line 24, insert "important" between "most" and "source" - Pg 6, line 4, "throwing" = "deposition" - Pg 6, line 5, "picked" = "collected" - Pg 6, line 13-15, not relevant here. - Pg 6, line 24, "rubbish" = "solid waste". - Pg 7, line 2, "second water source". . . "and the only one in the desert fringes" - Pg 7, line 3, delete "unfortunately" - Pg 7, line 4, delete "which lacking safe potable water source". - Pg 7, line 7, "absorbance" = "adsorption" - Pg 7, line 10, ". . .desert road, is vulnerable as a result of the unconfined condition of the aquifers". - Pg 7, line 14, which type of anthropogenic activities? - Pg 7, line 24, seem to be very high values.. - Pg 9, therefore treatment is needed before water containing Cd and Pb can be used for drinking

Interactive comment on Drink. Water Eng. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/dwes-2018-37, 2018.