

Interactive comment on “Online Total Organic Carbon (TOC) monitoring for water and wastewater treatment plants processes and operations optimization” by Céline Assmann et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 31 March 2017

The paper as presented showed some interesting examples of the use of TOC monitoring but was missing quite a bit. In the abstract it talks about BOD & COD not being useful for process control which is true which was applicable to one of the case studies demonstrated but not to the other two. The paper also seemed overly biased to one particular product in general and seemed more of a marketing paper rather than looking at the benefits of the technique as a whole.

It was very disappointing that in the references that there was no detailed reference to the work that WEF members have done on using TOC as an alternative to BOD for regulatory purposes as this was a seminal moment for the use of the technique this seems like quite a big thing to be missing in the paper.

C1

The paper is also a bit sensationalist digging into the BOD and COD techniques whilst not admitting the drawbacks of TOC (i.e. the cost and complexity of the technique).

I do think that the paper provides value which is why i haven't rejected it outright but I think it needs a major re-write with a big adjustment in the balance of the paper with a little bit more research into the usefulness of the analytical technique in the industry rather than being focused on one particular instrument and its uses

Interactive comment on Drink. Water Eng. Sci. Discuss., doi:10.5194/dwes-2017-11, 2017.

C2