Drink. Water Eng. Sci. Discuss., 8, C1–C2, 2015
www.drink-water-eng-sci-discuss.net/8/C1/2015/


Open Access
Drinking Water Engineering and Science Discussions



# *Interactive comment on* "Natural manganese deposits as catalyst for decomposing hydrogen peroxide" *by* A. H. Knol et al.

**P. Le-Clech (Referee)**

p.le-clech@unsw.edu.au

Received and published: 4 February 2015

This is an interesting study relying on the use of "natural manganese deposits" as a polishing step for hydrogen peroxide removal. It does address an important issue in water treatment and offers new opportunities. Still, the manuscript could benefit from the following considerations:

Abstract Avoid approximate expressions such as "more and more" Line 10: "were the same" than what?

Introduction: More reference needed to support the various claims (especially in the first few sentences) Symbols need proper identification (p3, line 22) Avoid terms like "apparently" (p4, line 3) More details information/background is needed to better



Full Screen / Esc
Printer-friendly Version
Interactive Discussion
Discussion Paper

(quicker) understand the nature/origin of the natural manganese deposits

Methods: It is not completely clear if the MCFgw have been practically used before their application in this study. If so, more details about their state need to be provided. Practically, how easy it would be to supply such similar materials on demand? “the first backwashing” is mentioned, but not information is given on that: why? How?

Results The authors could improve the readability of this section. E.g. Try to limit expression like “in one way or another”, or obvious statement such as “slope of the lines is the value of r” It would have been interesting to describe more in details the mechanisms/reasons behind those trends I am not sure all the proposed figures are needed. For example, Fig 7 does not directly target the decomposition phenomenon, and touch more on the practical operability of the system (another topic). The small discrepancies due to upflow rates is also not probably significant enough to deserve a graph.

---

Interactive comment on Drink. Water Eng. Sci. Discuss., 8, 1, 2015.