Drink. Water Eng. Sci. Discuss., 4, C18–C19, 2011 www.drink-water-eng-sci-discuss.net/4/C18/2011/ © Author(s) 2011. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.

Drinking Water Engineering and Science Discussions

DWESD

4, C18-C19, 2011

Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "Application of optical tomography in the study of discolouration in drinking water distribution systems" by P. van Thienen et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 17 August 2011

- 1.Does the paper address relevant scientific questions within the scope of DWES? Yes an area needs more research.
- 2.Does the paper present novel concepts, ideas, tools, or data? Yes a new way of monitoring and interpreting results.
- 3. Are substantial conclusions reached? Conclusions are not there yet
- 4. Are the scientific methods and assumptions valid and clearly outlined? Yes
- 5.Are the results sufficient to support the interpretations and conclusions? Need further rewording to make it clear

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



- 6.Is the description of experiments and calculations sufficiently complete and precise to allow their reproduction by fellow scientists (traceability of results)? Hard to say
- 7.Do the authors give proper credit to related work and clearly indicate their own new/original contribution? Yes
- 8.Does the title clearly reflect the contents of the paper? Easy to read and follow the paper
- 9. Does the abstract provide a concise and complete summary? May be expanded a little to include the conclusions drawn.
- 10.Is the overall presentation well structured and clear? Yes
- 11.Is the language fluent and precise? OK
- 12. Are mathematical formulae, symbols, abbreviations, and units correctly defined and used? Yes
- 13. Should any parts of the paper (text, formulae, figures, tables) be clarified, reduced, combined, or eliminated? Adequate in the current form
- 14. Are the number and quality of references appropriate? Yes
- 15.Is the amount and quality of supplementary material appropriate? Sufficient for this write-up

Interactive comment on Drink. Water Eng. Sci. Discuss., 4, 39, 2011.

DWESD

4, C18-C19, 2011

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

