Interactive comment on “MUWS (Microbiology in Urban Water Systems) – an interdisciplinary approach to study microbial communities in urban water systems” by P. Deines et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 16 May 2010

This manuscript relates to a “multidisciplinary” project aimed at characterising the microorganisms found in drinking water and sewer systems and link such characteristics with physical and engineering variables to provide novel insights. In principle this aim is an important one and if fulfilled will be of great use. For the most part it is well-written with only a few very minor typographical mistakes. The main limitation of this work is that there is no apparent linkage between the different disciplines; which could lead to the interpretation of the presented manuscript as a flawed study that did not fulfill its main aim with regards to multidisciplinarity. There is no attempt to interpret the results from the collected sample with environmental parameters (temperature, chlorine residual, hydraulic characteristics, etc). This is perhaps due to the apparent preliminary nature of the study. Also, it is unclear how many samples were collected, what point of the distribution/sewer system it was collected from, what time of the year, etc; there is no assurance that the collected samples are representative of distribution/sewer systems.