Drink. Water Eng. Sci. Discuss., 3, C20–C21, 2010 www.drink-water-eng-sci-discuss.net/3/C20/2010/ © Author(s) 2010. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.

Drinking Water Engineering and Science Discussions

Interactive comment on "I-WARP: individual water main renewal planner" by Y. Kleiner and B. Rajani

SS Saegrov (Referee)

sveinung.sagrov@ntnu.no

Received and published: 19 March 2010

The manuscript is excellent, I have only som few questions to it:

It seems like the data set being used is more homogenous than normal datasets will be, since it contains only 150 mm diameter, only cast iron pipes without corrosion protection and laid in a very short period (1956-1960) (see page 34). Did you test other datasets with a broader range of variations in pipe properties? (In the succeeding sentence you state that "available pipe data included pipe material, diameter etc ..." seems like a contradiction here.

May be you should discuss constraints before the model can be made available for consultancy. Has the model been compiled within a software, or spreadsheet? Is it open for researchers outside NRC, and on which conditions?

C20

Interactive comment on Drink. Water Eng. Sci. Discuss., 3, 25, 2010.