

Interactive comment on “Method development for arsenic analysis by modification in spectrophotometric technique” by M. A. Tahir et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 26 August 2008

This paper presents the authors' efforts to develop an arsenic analysis method by modifying a spectrophotometric technique. The overall impression of the author's argument would be drastically improved with the following points addressed.

1. What was modified and improved should be stated more clearly. Particularly, if the modified method achieved the goal of the study should be more emphasized in the Results and Discussion section.
2. Figure 7 has not been made properly. It should show a linear relationship, if the x-axis is As concentration by Spectrophotometer. These figures should be drawn in a square box. I believe Figure 4 does not convey the intention of the authors.

S50

3. Throughout the paper, statistical significance consideration is lacking. Figure 6 has any scientific meanings? More discussions should be given on these data to increase the impact of this paper.
4. Schematic diagrams should be illustrated rather than the photos in Figs. 2 & 3. So that other researchers could reproduce the experimental data.
5. Are there any obstacles for this method to be adopted as an appropriate analytical method particularly in developing countries? The authors' views on that would be highly appreciated.

Interactive comment on Drink. Water Eng. Sci. Discuss., 1, 135, 2008.

S51